# **5-4 Decisions**

### Alignment of the Majority

| Majority*                                   | Total (15) | Cases  |
|---|------------|--|
| Roberts, Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, Alito     | 5          | Clapper, Comcast, Genesis, Salinas, American Express |
| Kennedy, Ginsburg, Breyer, Sotomayor, Kagan | 5          | US Airways, McQuiggin, Trevino, Peugh, Actavis       |
| Roberts, Kennedy, Thomas, Breyer, Alito     | 2          | King, Maracich                                       |
| Scalia, Kennedy, Ginsburg, Sotomayor, Kagan | 1          | McNeely  |
| Scalia, Thomas, Ginsburg, Sotomayor, Kagan  | 1          | Jardines   |
| Thomas, Ginsburg, Breyer, Sotomayor, Kagan  | 1          | Alleyne  |

| Term    | Number of 5-4<br>Opinions** | Percentage<br>of Total<br>Opinions | Percentage<br>of 5-4 Split<br>Ideological | Conservative Victory<br>(Percentage of<br>Ideological) | Conservative Victory<br>(Percentage of All 5-4) | Number of<br>Different<br>Alignments | Alignments<br>Divided by<br>5-4 Opinions |
|---------|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|---|--|---|--------------------------------------|--|
| ОТо5    | 11                          | 12%                                | 73%                                       | 63%  | 45%   | 7                                    | 0.64                                     |
| ОТ06    | 24                          | 33%                                | 79%                                       | 68%  | 54%   | 6                                    | 0.25                                     |
| ОТ07    | 12                          | 17%                                | 67%                                       | 50%  | 33%   | 6                                    | 0.50                                     |
| ОТо8    | 23                          | 29%                                | 70%                                       | 69%  | 48%   | 7                                    | 0.30                                     |
| ОТо9    | 16                          | 19%                                | 69%                                       | 73%  | 50%   | 7                                    | 0.44                                     |
| OT10    | 16                          | 20%                                | 88%                                       | 71%  | 63%   | 4                                    | 0.25                                     |
| OT11    | 15                          | 20%                                | 67%                                       | 50%  | 33%   | 7                                    | 0.47                                     |
| OT12    | 15                          | 23%                                | 67%                                       | 50%  | 33%   | 6                                    | 0.40                                     |
| Average | 17                          | 22%                                | 72%                                       | 62%  | 45%   | 6                                    | 0.41                                     |

<sup>\*</sup> This table features cases that were decided by a 5-3 margin, but were reclassified for our purposes as 5-4 decisions.

\*\* For the purposes of this chart, the total number of 5-4 opinions is the number of cases that split 5-4 on a major issue. It may differ from the number of cases that split 5-4 elsewhere in this Stat Pack.

\*\*\* For the purposes of this chart, a "Conservative Win" occurs whenever the majority consists of Chief Justice Roberts and Justices Scalia, Kennedy, Thomas, and O'Connor or Alito.

# **5-4 Decisions**

(continued)

#### **Membership in a Five-to-Four Majority**

| Justice   | Cases<br>Decided | Frequency in Majority |     | OT11 | OT10 | ОТо9 | ОТо8 | ОТ07 |
|-----------|------------------|-----------------------|-----|------|------|------|------|------|
| Kennedy   | 15               | 13                    | 87% | 80%  | 88%  | 69%  | 78%  | 67%  |
| Thomas    | 15               | 9                     | 60% | 67%  | 75%  | 69%  | 65%  | 67%  |
| Ginsburg  | 15               | 8                     | 53% | 33%  | 38%  | 25%  | 52%  | 50%  |
| Breyer    | 15               | 8                     | 53% | 47%  | 31%  | 38%  | 39%  | 45%  |
| Sotomayor | 14               | 8                     | 53% | 47%  | 38%  | 43%  | _    | -    |
| Kagan     | 15               | 8                     | 53% | 40%  | 38%  | -    | -    | -    |
| Roberts   | 15               | 7                     | 47% | 67%  | 63%  | 56%  | 48%  | 58%  |
| Scalia    | 15               | 7                     | 47% | 60%  | 69%  | 69%  | 70%  | 58%  |
| Alito     | 14               | 7                     | 47% | 60%  | 63%  | 63%  | 52%  | 50%  |

#### **Five-to-Four Majority Opinion Authorship**

These percentages consider how often a Justice authors the majority opinion when that Justice is in the majority.\*

| Justice   | Cases<br>Decided | Frequency in the Majority | Opinions<br>Authored | Frequency as<br>Author | OT11 | OT10 | ОТо9 | ОТо8 | ОТ07 |
|-----------|------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Scalia    | 15               | 7                         | 3                    | 43%                    | 0%   | 9%   | 18%  | 33%  | 29%  |
| Alito     | 14               | 7                         | 2                    | 29%                    | 33%  | ο%   | 40%  | 8%   | 17%  |
| Breyer    | 15               | 8                         | 2                    | 25%                    | 43%  | 20%  | 25%  | ο%   | 40%  |
| Sotomayor | 14               | 8                         | 2                    | 25%                    | 29%  | 17%  | 0%   | _    | -    |
| Thomas    | 15               | 9                         | 2                    | 22%                    | 0%   | 33%  | 9%   | 13%  | 13%  |
| Kennedy   | 15               | 13                        | 2                    | 15%                    | 33%  | 21%  | 22%  | 28%  | 50%  |
| Ginsburg  | 15               | 8                         | 1                    | 13%                    | 0%   | 33%  | 50%  | 27%  | ο%   |
| Kagan     | 15               | 8                         | 1                    | 13%                    | 17%  | ο%   | -    | -    | -    |
| Roberts   | 15               | 7                         | 0                    | 0%                     | 10%  | 30%  | 22%  | 18%  | 14%  |

<sup>\*</sup> Percentages represent the number of majority opinions authored divided by the number of times a Justice was in the majority for a signed opinion. As such, 5-4 per curiam opinions are omitted entirely.