

Nos. 17-40, 17-42

---

---

IN THE  
**Supreme Court of the United States**

---

COACHELLA VALLEY WATER DISTRICT, ET AL.,  
*Petitioners,*

v.

AGUA CALIENTE BAND OF CAHUILLA INDIANS AND  
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,  
*Respondents.*

---

DESERT WATER AGENCY, ET AL.,  
*Petitioners,*

v.

AGUA CALIENTE BAND OF CAHUILLA INDIANS AND  
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,  
*Respondents.*

---

**On Petitions for a Writ of Certiorari to the  
United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit**

---

**SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF OF RESPONDENT  
AGUA CALIENTE BAND OF CAHUILLA INDIANS**

---

CATHERINE F. MUNSON	ADAM H. CHARNES
MARK H. REEVES	<i>Counsel of Record</i>
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND	KILPATRICK TOWNSEND &
& STOCKTON LLP	STOCKTON LLP
607 14th Street, NW,	2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 4400
Suite 900	Dallas, TX 75201
Washington, DC 20005	(214) 922-7106
(202) 508-5800	acharnes@kilpatricktownsend.com
JOHN TABINACA PLATA	STEVEN C. MOORE
AGUA CALIENTE BAND OF	HEATHER WHITEMAN RUNS HIM
CAHUILLA INDIANS	NATIVE AMERICAN RIGHTS FUND
5401 Dinah Shore Drive	1506 Broadway
Palm Springs, CA 92264	Boulder, CO 80302
(760) 699-6837	(303) 447-8760

*Attorneys for the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians*

---

---

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	ii
SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF .....	1
CONCLUSION .....	3

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES****Cases**

<i>Cutter v. Wilkinson</i> , 544 U.S. 709 (2005).....	2
<i>Great Southern Fire Proof Hotel Co. v. Jones</i> , 177 U.S. 449 (1900).....	2
<i>McLane Co. v. EEOC</i> , 137 S. Ct. 1159 (2017).....	2
<i>Steel Co. v. Citizens for a Better Env't</i> , 523 U.S. 83 (1998).....	2
<i>Winters v. United States</i> , 207 U.S. 564 (1908).....	3

**Rules**

Sup. Ct. Rule 15.8.....	1
-------------------------	---

## SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF

Respondent Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians (Agua Caliente) respectfully submits this supplemental brief, pursuant to Rule 15.8, to bring to the Court's attention developments since the filing of its brief in opposition that further highlight the vehicle problem with the petitions.

As Agua Caliente previously explained (Br. in Opp. 13), the district court trifurcated this case, and the petitions arise from the district court's decision following phase 1 of the litigation. After the Ninth Circuit affirmed, the district court lifted its stay and the case has proceeded with litigation related to phase 2. D. Ct. Dkt. 180. On October 20, 2017, petitioner Coachella Valley Water District (CVWD) filed a motion for partial summary judgment on phase 2 issues. D. Ct. Dkt. 200. In CVWD's memorandum in support of that motion, CVWD argues—for the first time in this case<sup>1</sup>—that the district court lacks Article III jurisdiction over Agua Caliente's claims.

Specifically, CVWD contends that “[t]he Tribe lacks standing to seek a declaration of the quantity of groundwater to which it is entitled....”<sup>2</sup> *Id.* at 11. CVWD argues that Agua Caliente has suffered no injury because “it has provided no basis to believe that it will ever actually pump groundwater,” so there is no “certainly impending ... injury in fact.” *Id.* at 11-12

---

<sup>1</sup> In its answer, CVWD admitted that the district court had subject-matter jurisdiction. D. Ct. Dkt. 39, at 2.

<sup>2</sup> CVWD also contends that Agua Caliente's claim that it owns the underground pore space is not justiciable. D. Ct. Dkt. 200, at 13-14. Although its brief is less than clear, it appears that petitioner Desert Water Agency agrees. D. Ct. Dkt. 202, at 1-2. The pore-space claim is not relevant to the petitions.

(emphasis omitted). Further, CVWD asks the district court to dismiss the case “under prudential ripeness doctrine” because the dispute is “abstract.” *Id.* at 12.

CVWD’s petition and reply brief in this Court contain no hint that it disputes the existence of Article III jurisdiction. *See* CVWD Reply Br. 7 (stating that “the Court unquestionably has jurisdiction” over “[t]his case”). And Agua Caliente disagrees with CVWD’s contentions, as it will explain to the district court in due course. But whichever party is correct, the important point is that, if this Court grants certiorari, this Court *necessarily* will need to address the jurisdictional questions raised by CVWD *before* it reaches the questions presented by either petition. *See Steel Co. v. Citizens for a Better Env’t*, 523 U.S. 83, 93 (1998) (“On every writ of error or appeal, the first and fundamental question is that of jurisdiction, first, of this court, and then of the court from which the record comes.”) (quoting *Great Southern Fire Proof Hotel Co. v. Jones*, 177 U.S. 449, 453 (1900)). The jurisdictional issues, however, involve no novel or important questions, or split in relevant authority, that warrant this Court’s review. Moreover, this Court would be forced to decide the jurisdictional questions without the benefit of district court and Ninth Circuit decisions and with no evidentiary record. Such a posture violates the familiar precept that this is “a court of review, not of first view.” *McLane Co. v. EEOC*, 137 S. Ct. 1159, 1170 (2017) (quoting *Cutter v. Wilkinson*, 544 U.S. 709, 718 n.7 (2005)).

In sum, CVWD’s jurisdictional challenge to Agua Caliente’s standing and to the ripeness of its claims represents yet another reason why the petitions are

poor vehicles to address the *Winters* questions advanced in those petitions.

**CONCLUSION**

The Court should deny the petitions for a writ of certiorari.

Respectfully submitted.

CATHERINE F. MUNSON  
MARK H. REEVES  
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND &  
STOCKTON LLP  
607 14th Street, NW,  
Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 508-5800

STEVEN C. MOORE  
HEATHER WHITEMAN  
RUNS HIM  
NATIVE AMERICAN RIGHTS  
FUND  
1506 Broadway  
Boulder, CO 80302  
(303) 447-8760

ADAM H. CHARNES  
*Counsel of Record*  
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND &  
STOCKTON LLP  
2001 Ross Avenue,  
Suite 4400  
Dallas, TX 75201  
(214) 922-7106

acharnes@  
kilpatricktownsend.com  
JOHN TABINACA PLATA  
AGUA CALIENTE BAND OF  
CAHUILLA INDIANS  
5401 Dinah Shore Drive  
Palm Springs, CA 92264  
(760) 699-6837

*Counsel for Respondent Agua Caliente  
Band of Cahuilla Indians*